

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: December 19, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Robbie Cangelosi

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the November 21, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 1427 Esplanade Ave. St.

Application: Christopher Mardis, applicant; Coulon Development LLC, owner; New construction of six-unit, three-story residential building

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with details to be worked out at Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The header heights of the door, window and garage door on the front elevation should align.
- The header heights of the two smaller windows on the southeast elevation should align with the other windows.
- The light fixture on the front elevation should be more contemporary.
- The side door on the southeast elevation should be simplified.
- The control joints in the stucco façade should be shown in elevation.
- The detail drawings should match the elevations, including the front door.
- The railing details need to match on all elevations. All railing visible from the public right of way should match.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 3000 St. Claude Ave.

Application: EDR Architects, applicant; 3000-3032 St Claude Ave LLC, 3000-3032 St Claude Ave LLC, owner; Renovation of five existing buildings into a hotel, including the new construction of a building on the site. This project includes five parcels: municipal address 3000, 3014, 3020-22, 3024-26, and 3030-32 St. Claude Avenue.

Speakers: Edward Joyner spoke neutrally about the application. Eve Abrams, Suzie Marzan, Ian Amans, Micheal Esealuka, Calvin Duncan, Amy Myers, Brett Deneau, Panacea Theriac, Megan Kiffen, Danielle Maggio, David Rolston, and Carin Baos spoke against the application.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to to defer the application. The ARC agreed that the proposal does not appear to have appropriately considered the existing conditions. The ARC requested that the applicant modify the design based on the discussion of the project, including:

- Maintain the front stoop/stair conditions at the St Claude elevations for all buildings.
- Remove the 2nd floor bridges between the buildings as this is not a standard condition in the district.
- Adjust the windows on camel back additions such that their size, muntin pattern and location are more appropriate for the district.
- Add gable vents to the camel back additions.
- Investigate adaptive reuse design opportunity for the 1960's ranch style corner building.
- Modify the design of the new building on St Claude to have fenestration or some expression of human habitation.

Second: Elliott Perkins.

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 3700 Canal St.

Application: Heather Little, applicant; Rectors Wardens And Vestrymen Of Grace Church, owner; Renovation of an existing Landmark church and rectory to include the construction of a residential care center four- story addition.

Speakers: Casey Nunez, Renda Rviz, Lee Watermeir, Brady Lester, Lara Lester, Mary Gudala, Anil Desu, and Jessica Blanchard spoke against the application

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the treatment of the Landmark building at the connection element is successful, but the proposal is too large and massive for the context and residential scaled streetscapes. The ARC agreed that the parking below structure seems out of character with the neighborhood and needs a more solid edge at the street. The ARC recommended breaking up the mass to create rhythms typically found at the street edge. They agreed the courtyards were dwarfed the mass of the addition and suggested investigating 'U' or 'L' shaped masses where courtyards had visual access to the streets. They recommended additional study of the shapes and forms of the Landmark context in developing a revised proposal. Within this study, they cautioned against overt replication and stressed compatibility over competition

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 1213 Magazine St.
Application: Kelly Johnson, applicant; 1209 -11 Magazine LLC, owner; New construction of three story, two family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the second story windows at the front elevation should be taller, the front wall of the dormer set back and the vents at the porch should located within the center of the bay.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
10. 2851 Chippewa St.
Application: Pearce Grieshaber, applicant; Carl J Mastio, owner; Renovate and construct 500 SF addition to a single-family residential building.
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC was concerned that the addition seemed to overwhelm the original structure 2-bay shotgun. They recommend changing the roof from a gable to a hip roof and making the windows more vertical. Please include perspectives from the right side of the building for the upcoming meeting.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
11. 1376 Camp St.
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family, residential building on a vacant lot.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The cornice and the second story gallery should be in line with the adjacent property, this can be accomplished by lowering the ceiling height at the ground floor. The roof pitch should be raised to 7/12. The side entrance should be reconfigured so the door faces the street.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
12. 1127-31 Terpsichore St.
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family, residential building on a vacant lot.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to to defer this application for additional review. The proportions of the 3-bay double gallery are too narrow and it should be restudied as a 2-bay. The floor to ceiling heights should be reconfigured so the porch is dropped similar to the proposal at 1376 Camp St.
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:

13. 323 Verret St.
Application: Joe Peraino, applicant; Dogs On The Roof LLC, owner; Renovate existing two-story mixed-use building, including new rooftop addition and exterior cladding materials.
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
14. 2609 St Claude St.
Application: Diane Hickman, applicant; Donald Corp017/0038 Mc, owner; Renovation of existing McDonalds to include facade and elevation modifications, accent walls, overhangs, metal trellis, and signage updates.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposal aligns more with a franchise prototype than a contextual design. The ARC agreed that the limitations of the existing site and structure inclined the ARC to allow the honesty of the franchise to 'be what it is'. They recommended landscape modifications to address the streetscape at this prominent corner. They suggested investigating such elements as street and onsite trees in the parking lot, 4'-0" high low walls around the perimeter, reduced glare lighting, and modifications to the pedestrian approach from the public right of way. The ARC agreed that this walkway would require additional review and recommended submission of a revised site plan to the Staff for review prior to the final stamped submission.
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments
15. 1505 Marais St.
Application: Peter Waring, applicant; The Bayouproject LLC, owner; New construction of a one-story, single family residence.
Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with details to be worked out at Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:
- Remove decorative features on side porch, including, quoins and the bracket.
 - Add a box beam to the side porch.
 - A window should be added at the left elevation, near the front of the house.
 - The security lights should be raised to a more regular height.
- Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:

16. 1007 St Roch Ave.
Application: Robert Pell, applicant; Crescent Resources LLC, owner; Demolition of existing two-story residential building and new construction of two-story residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
17. 616 Elmira St.
Application: Robert Pell, applicant; Christophe and Heather Szapary, owner; Renovation of existing residential building including construction of new side porch.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
18. 924 Reynes St.
Application: John C. Williams, applicant; 4900 N Rampart LLC, owner; New Construction of a single-family residential building on a vacant lot.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
19. 951 St Mary St.
Application: Ronald Francis Jouandot, applicant; Jouandot Enterprises LLC, owner; Demolition of existing one story structure, and new construction of two story residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal.
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:
23. 953 St Mary St.
Application: Ronald Francis Jouandot, applicant; Jouandot Enterprises LLC, owner; Demolition of existing structure and new construction of two story, single family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.